

Notes1

1. See David Alan Brown, with contributions by Elizabeth Cropper and Eleonora Luciana, *Virtue and Beauty: Leonardo's Ginevra de' Benci and Renaissance Portraits of Women*, exh. cat., (Washington, D.C., National Gallery of Art, 2001) pp. 190-193. The phrase was translated by John Shearman, and reprinted in Brown et al., p. 193.
2. On *Ginevra de' Benci*, see Brown et al., *Virtue and Beauty*, pp. 142-147.
3. See Merry Wiesner-Hanks, "Women's Authority in the State and Household in Early Modern Europe," in Annette Dixon, ed. *Women Who Ruled: Queens, Goddesses, Amazons in Renaissance and Baroque Art*, exh. cat. (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Museum of Art, in association with Merrell Publications: London, 2002) pp. 27-59, 32.
4. On the "Mask of Youth," See Nanette Salomon, "Positioning Women in Visual Convention: The Case of Elizabeth I," in *Attending to Women in Early Modern England*, ed. Betty S. Travitsky and Adele F. Seeff, (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1994) pp. 64-95
5. Efrat Tseëlon, *The Masque of Femininity: The Presentation of Woman in Everyday Life*, Sage Publications, Theory, Culture & Society, ed. Mike Featherstone, University of Teesside, (London, and Thousand Oaks, New Delhi: Sage Publications, 1995)

6. Plato's ideas on the treachery of rhetoric, which can be applied to the illusionism of art, are contained in his *Gorgias*, 465B, in *The Dialogues of Plato*, trans. R.E. Allen (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1984) 1:249-50. See the relevant discussion in Jacqueline Lichtenstein, *The Eloquence of Color: Rhetoric and Painting in the French Classical Age*, trans. Emily McVarish (Berkeley, Los Angeles and London: University of California Press, 1993). These ideas are summarized in her article, "On Platonic Cosmetics," in Bill Beckley and David Shapiro, eds., *Uncontrollable Beauty: Toward New Aesthetics* (New York: Allworth Press, 1998) pp. 83-100. Kant's centrally important ideas on beauty are contained in Immanuel Kant, *Critique of Judgement*, trans. Werner S. Pluhar (Indianapolis: Hackett Press, 1987) esp. 76-180. Particularly interesting recent commentaries on Kant's ideas include Marcia Eaton, "Kantian and Contextual Beauty," in Peg Zeglin Brand, ed., *Beauty Matters*, (Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press, 2000) pp. 27-36, and in the same volume, Arthur Danto, "Beauty and Beautification," pp. 65-86, in which the author also discusses the distinctions between Kant's and Hegel's ideas of beauty. See G. W. F. Hegel, *Aesthetics: Lectures on Fine Art*, vol. I, trans. T.M. Knox (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1975).

7. See James Hillman, "The Practice of Beauty," in Beckley and Shapiro, *Uncontrollable Beauty*, pp. 261-274, 262; Dave Hickey's essay is included in *The Invisible Dragon: Four Essays on Beauty* (Art issues. Press: Los Angeles, Calif., 1995); in addition to Danto's "Beauty and Beautification" in Brand, *Beauty*

Matters, see also his “Beauty for Ashes,” in Neal Benezra and Olga M. Viso, eds., *Regarding Beauty*, exh. cat., (Hirshorn Museum and Sculpture Garden, Smithsonian Institution, Washington, D.C. in association with Hatje Cantz Publishers, 1999). Other recent publications concerned with beauty include: Francette Pacteau, *The Symptom of Beauty*, (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1994); James Kirwan, *Beauty*, (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press, 1999); Elaine Scarry, *On Beauty and Being Just*, (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1999); Sander Gilman, *Creating Beauty to Cure the Soul: Race and Psychology in the Shaping of Aesthetic Surgery*, (Durham and London: Duke University Press, 1998); and Jean de Loisy, *La beauté*, exh. cat., (Avignon, France: Musée des Beaux Arts, 2000).

8. In addition to Sherman, I am thinking particularly of Janine Antoni, Jenny Saville, and Lisa Yuskavage.

9. Plotinus is quoted in Hillman, “The Practice of Beauty,” p. 272, (I.6.2). On the incompatibility of modernism with beauty, see Barnett Newman, “The Sublime is Now.” *Tiger’s Eye* (December 1948), Reprinted in John O’Neill, ed., *Barnett Newman: Selected Writings and Interviews*, (New York: Knopf, 1990) p. 172.

10. See Hubert Damisch, “Freud with Kant? The Enigma of Pleasure,” in Beckley and Shapiro, *Uncontrollable Beauty*, pp. 101-112, 106.

11. The most recent discussion of the portrait is found in Gary Tinterow and Philip Conisbee, eds., *Portraits by Ingres: Image of an Epoch*, exh. cat., (New

York:Metropolitan Museum of Art and London: National Gallery of Art, in association with Harry N. Abrams, Inc., New York, 1999), pp. 138-140. The quote is taken from Walter Friedlander, *David to Delacroix*, trans. Robert Goldwater (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1952), p.79.

12. Review of the exhibition in London by Richard Dorment, *The Daily Telegraph*, Jan. 27, 1999, pp. 18-19, “In the gallery hung with his oil portraits of the French residents of Rome we meet the formidable Comtesse de Tournon, happy to have Ingres record not only the hollows of her toothless cheeks and her auburn wig, but even a small mole on the bridge of her bulbous nose.”

13. Painting files, Department of European Art Before 1900, Philadelphia Museum of Art. I thank both Jennifer Vanim and Joseph Rishel for taking the time to discuss this painting with me, and for making all the files available. Letter from Agnes Mongan to Henry McIlhenny, April 29, 1935. Mongan describes Paul Sachs’ reaction to the Comtesse’s portrait: “[he], on the other hand, finds her ugliness so strong and so individual that it becomes to him attractive. He said he’d love to have the old girl around, and if an Ingres portrait were to be bought for the Fogg, that’s one he’d like to have.” There is also in the file a letter from the dealer Paul Rosenberg, who offers the painting for examination to McIlhenny, and sends it to Philadelphia on the ship, the *Normandie*: “It is a glorious picture of the best period of this artist, and the last to be got. I bought it directly from the family, and I have offered it to nobody, giving you the first chance to acquire it, and to enrich

with it your collection. Its price is \$55,000, which is very moderate, and makes it a real bargain....I am sure you will be agreeably surprised to see this marvel, and I am certain that on receipt you will cable me that you keep it.”

14. See Norman Bryson: *Tradition and Desire: From David to Delacroix* (Cambridge, England and New York: Cambridge University Press, 1984), pp. 85-175.

15. Conservation files cannot be directly quoted, so I have paraphrased Tucker’s comments from the Painting files in the Department of European Art Before 1900 at the Philadelphia Museum of Art. The orange repaints were removed on May 4, 1995, as Tucker worked to thin the varnish over the hair, being careful to avoid damaging the glazes Ingres originally applied.

16. Karen L. Kleinfelder, “Ingres as a Blasted Allegory,” *Art History*, vol. 23, no.5 (December, 2000) 800-817, 807 for the quote on Lacan. In note 25, p. 816, Kleinfelder writes, “Actually there is a possible source in Ingres even for those facial warts. I have Susan Siegfried to thank for referring me to Ingres’s portrait of Madame de Tournon, painted in 1812, which hangs in the Philadelphia Museum of Art, where Cindy Sherman may well have seen it.”

17. Quoted in Douglass Shand-Tucci, *The Art of Scandal: The Life and Times of Isabella Stewart Gardner* (New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 1997) p. 151. Originally in Morris Carter, *Isabella Stewart Gardner and Fenway Court* (Boston:

Houghton Mifflin, 1925) p. 25; Shand, p. 151, orig. in Elsie de Wolf, *After All* (New York: Harper Brothers, 1935) p. 102.

18. On Sargent's *Madame X*, see Susan Sidlauskas, "Painting Skin: John Singer Sargent's *Madame X*, *American Art*, Fall 2001, Vol. 15, no. 3 (November 2001): 8-33.

19. Shand-Tucci, *Art of Scandal*, p. 71. Shand-Tucci, p. 313, n. 20 admits that the original source of this observation is not verifiable, and was simply a scandalous comment that was widely circulated.

20. Shand-Tucci, *Art of Scandal*, p. 314, n. 22, comments that the first time James' quote appears in print was in Paul Bourget's *Outre-Mer: Impressions of America* (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, New York, 1895) vol. 1, pp. 106-109.

21. See Kathleen Weil-Garris Brandt, "Mrs. Gardner's Renaissance," *Fenway Court*, 1990-91, "Imaging the Self in Renaissance Italy," pp. 10-30, p. 25. Brandt offers an excellent discussion of Gardner's patronage, which favored Renaissance portraits of women, and also discusses at length the Sargent portrait of Gardner, as well as Bourget's comments on the painting, which she reprints in full at the end of her article.

22. Brandt, "Mrs. Gardner's Renaissance," quoted on p. 27. Orig. Bourget, *Outre-Mer*, pp. 106-109.

23. Shand-Tucci in *Art of Scandal* quotes Morris Carter, *Isabella Stewart Gardner*, p. 71.

24. Carter, *Isabella Stewart Gardner*, p. 220.

25. Some viewers apparently read a certain tentativeness into Gardner's pose.

Louise Hall Tharp, another early biographer, wrote that the subject was "a woman leaning forward, a little unsure of herself, not entirely happy, but not in the least arrogant," *Mrs. Jack* (Boston: Little, Brown, 1965). Quoted by Brandt, "Mrs. Gardner's Renaissance," p. 18.

26. An undated copy of the photograph from the *Boston Evening Transcript* is in a scrapbook housed at the archives of the Isabella Stewart Gardner Museum.

27. James is quoted in Shand-Tucci, *Art of Scandal*, p. 46, as is Bernard Berenson, p. 151. Orig. letter from Bernard Berenson to Mary Berenson, September 1897, quoted in Samuels, *Connoisseur*, 286. Bourget, *Outre-Mer*, is quoted by Brandt, "Mrs. Gardner's Renaissance," p. 27 and p. 28.

28. The friend was Alice De Lamar, who described Gardner's appearance for a visit from Bernard Berenson. Quoted in Shand-Tucci, *Art of Scandal*, p. 301.

Lamar originally published her observations as "Some Little Known Facts," *Forum* 3 (Fall, 1960): 30.

29. See, to name just a few, Richard Brilliant, *Portraiture*, (London, Reaktion Books, 1991); Joanna Woodall, ed. and intro., *Portraiture: Facing the Subject* (Manchester: University of Manchester Press, 1997); Benjamin Buchloh, "Residual Resemblance: Three Notes on the Ends of Portraiture," in M. Felman, ed. *Face-Off: The Portrait in Recent Art*, exh. cat., (Philadelphia: Institute of

Contemporary Art, 1994) pp. 53-69; and Marcia Pointon, *Hanging the Head: Portraiture and Social Formation in Eighteenth-Century England* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1993).

30. Woodall, *Facing the Subject*, p. 17.

31. Joseph Rishel in Rishel and Françoise Cachin, *Cézanne*, exh. cat., (Philadelphia: Philadelphia Museum of Art, 1996), Rishel, p. 318.

32. Linda Nochlin, "Cézanne: Studies in Contrast," *Art in America*, (June 1996): 65.

33. The few studies devoted to the portraits of Hortense Fiquet Cézanne include Anne H. Van Buren, "Madame Cézanne's Fashions and the Date of her Portraits," *The Art Quarterly*, vol. 29, no. 2 (1966): 111-27; Bob Kirsch, "Paul Cézanne's *Jeune Fille au Piano* and Some Portraits of his Wife: An Investigation of his Painting of the Late 1870's," *Gazette des Beaux-Arts*, 6th per. Vol. 100 (July-August 1987): 2-26. None of these are extended studies of the paintings themselves. Rudolf Arnheim wrote a sensitive study of *Madame Cézanne*, 1890-94, Art Institute of Chicago, in *Art and Visual Perception*, Berkeley, Calif, Univ. of California Press, 1966, pp. 27-31. There are also discussions of the *Madame Cézanne* portraits in recent catalogues: in Rishel and Cachin, *Cézanne*, pp. 170-172, 318-321, 346-47, 399-401. Also see Felix Baumann, Evelyn Benesch, Walter Feilchenfeldt, Klaus Schroder, eds. *Cézanne Finished Unfinished*, exh. cat.,

Kunstforum, Wien, and Kunsthaus Zurich, in association with Hatje Cantz

Publishers and Authors, 2000, pp. 135-139, 145-47, 153-171.

34. For a schematic biography of Fiquet Cézanne, see John Rewald, *Paul Cézanne: A Biography*, trans. Margaret H. Liebman, orig. 1939, New York: Simon and Schuster, 1948, p. 77.

35. Paul Alexis to Emile Zola, quoted in John Rewald, *Cézanne: A Biography*, p. 114.

36. Roger Fry, notes from May 1925, while he was at work on *Cézanne: A Study of His Development*, London, 1927.

37. Jack Lindsay, *The Life and Art of Cézanne*, (London, 1969), p. 131.

38. Rewald, *Cézanne: A Biography*, p. 77. Rewald writes, “This change in Cézanne’s emotional life does not appear to have influenced either his art or his relationships to his friends.”

39. Rewald, *Cézanne: A Biography*, p. 77.

40. Robert Walser, “Das Tor zur Moderne. Paul Cézanne in Schweizer Sammlungen,” in *du*, Sept. 9, 1989, quoted in Gotz Adriani, *Cézanne Paintings*, exh. cat., trans. Russell Stockman, Dumont Buchverlag, Cologne, with Harry Abrams, New York, 1995. Orig. Kunsthalle, Tübingen, 1993.

41. On the film stills, see *Cindy Sherman: Untitled Film Stills*, with a text by Arthur C. Danto, New York: Rizzoli, 1990.

42. Important discussions of Sherman's work include: Stephen W. Melville, "The Time of Exposure: Allegorical Self-Portraiture in Cindy Sherman," *Arts Magazine*, vol. 60, no. 5 (January 1986): 17-21; *Cindy Sherman: Photographic Work, 1975-1995*, ed. Zdenek Felix and Martin Schwander, with essay by Elisabeth Bronfen (Hamburg: Schirmer Art Books, Deichtorhallen, 199, with the Konstell, Malmo, and Kunstmuseum, Lucerne.) *Cindy Sherman: Works, 1975-1993*, with essays by Rosalind Krauss, and Norman Bryson, (New York: Rizzoli, 1993), and *Cindy Sherman: History Portraits*, with a text by Arthur Danto, (New York: Rizzoli, 1991); *Cindy Sherman: Retrospective*, with essays by Amanda Cruz, Elizabeth A.T. Smith, and Amelia Jones, exh. cat. (Chicago: Museum of Contemporary Art, and Los Angeles: The Museum of Contemporary Art, with London: Thames and Hudson, 1998). This catalogue has a complete bibliography on Sherman through 1998.

43. Edward Leffingwell, "Cindy Sherman at Metro Pictures," *Art in America*, vol. 89, no. 6 (June, 2001): 126. Leffingwell writes that Sherman, "performed portraits of women at a certain age in which her subjects bare some of the introspective and flamboyant moments of their lives. She set up the lights, reached for the paint-by-numbers makeup kits and called out to the loopy stylist in her heart....there's a frisson of defiance in the air, acrid and electric as the smell of ozone."

44. Joan Rivière, "Womanliness as Masquerade," *Psychoanalysis and Female Sexuality*, ed. Hendrik M. Ruitenbeek (New Haven: College and UP, 1966). The

essay was originally published in *The International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 10 (1929).